Comparison of European Biochar Certificate Version 4. 8 and IBI Biochar Standards Version 2.0 and Baseline Biochar Metrics Ver IX

European Biochar Certificate first publication March 2012 <u>http://www.european-biochar.org/en/home</u>
 IBI Biochar Standards first publication May 2012 <u>http://www.biochar-international.org/characterizationstandard</u>
 Baseline Biochar Metrics, Ver X, dated Nov 18, 2016

Parameter	European Biochar Certificate V4.8 Status (Parameter)	EBC Test Method	IBI Biochar Standards V2.0 Status (Parameter)	IBI Test Method	Baseline Biochar Metrics Ver IX Status (Parameter)	BBM Test Method - see Baseline Biochar Metrics, Ver IX, dated Nov 4, 2016 for detailed instructions for individual metrics
	Criteria (Units)		Criteria (Units)		Criteria (Units)	
Water Content	Required (Water content)	DIN 51718 method A Two step: raw moisture at $(40 \pm 2)^{\circ}$ C until constant mass; hygroscopic moisture in TGA crucible and nitrogen atmosphere at $(106 \pm 2)^{\circ}$ C to constant mass.	Required (Moisture content)	ASTM D1762-84 'Standard Test Method for Chemical Analysis of Wood Charcoal' Moisture content at 105 °C for 2 hours.	Required in "Dry Biochar" Procedure as "Weight loss on Drying"	Dry at 145C to 155C as per ASTM D2867 "Standard Test Methods for Molsture in Activated Carbon" (available for purchase at http://www.astm.org/Standards/D2867.htm)
	Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis)		Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis)	Source of Error - does not remove moisture in micro-pores of biochar	Declaration (weight fraction of total mass, wet basis)	
Total Ash	Required	DIN 51719, ISO 1171 or EN 14775 – ashing at 550°C, heating at 5 K/min to 106°C under nitrogen atmosphere then at 5 K/min to 550°C under oxygen, hold for 1h	Required	ASTM D1762-84 "Standard Test Method for Chemical Analysis of Wood Charcoal". Ash at 750 °C for 6 hours.	Required in "Dry Biochar" Procedure as "Inorganic Dry Weight Fraction"	Dry at 14SC to 15SC as per ASTM D2867 "Standard Test Methods for Moisture in Activated Carbon" (available for purchase at http://www.astm.org/Standards/D2867.htm)
	Declaration		Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis)	Air dried and ground sample, dry at 10SC for two hours, covered volatile matter to 950C, then ash at 750C for 6 hrs uncovered	Declaration (weight fraction of total mass, dry basis)	Open crucible ashing at 550C in air for two hours - similar to EBC Method
				Source of Error - Temp too high - volatilizes carbonates, lowers ash determination		
Volatile Matter	Required (Volatile Organic Compounds (VOCs))	Thermal-Gravimetric-Analysis (TGA) using Leco TGA 701 – total mass loss at 950°C	Optional (Volatile matter)	ASTM D1762-84 'Standard Test Method for Chemical Analysis of Wood Charcoal'. VM content at 950 °C for 10 minutes.	Required in "Dry Biochar" Procedure as "Volatile Dry Weight Fraction"	Dry at 145C to 155C as per ASTM D2867 "Standard Test Methods for Moisture in Activated Carbon" (available for purchase at http://www.astm.org/Standards/D2867.htm)
	Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis)		Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis)	Source of Error - Temp too high - additonal carbonization, volatilizes carbonates, elevates volatile determination	Declaration (weight fraction of total mass, dry basis)	Vented crucible at 450C for two hours
C content	Required (Total C)	Total C, H, N analysis by dry combustion IR-	Required (Organic C)	Total C and H analysis by dry combustion- IR detection.	Replaced by Resident Matter	This section concerns itself with measurements of properties that
	Biochar 2 50% Biochar 2 50% Bio Carbon Minerals (BCM) < 50% (% of total mass, dry basis)	detection (DIN 51732, ISO 29541). Inorganic Canalysis by determination of carbonate C content with ICJ, as outlined in DIN 51726, ISO 925. Organic C calculated as Total C – Inorganic C.	10% Minimum Class 1: 260% Class 2: 230% and <60% Class 3: 2:10% and <30% (% of total mass, dry basis)	Inorganic C analysis by determination of CO>-C content with 1N HCI, as outlined in ASTM D4373 'Standard Test Method for Rapid Determination of Carbonate Content of Solis'. Organic C calculated as Total C – Inorganic C.	Declaration (weight fraction of total mass, dry basis) - calculated from total weight less Volatiles and Inorganics	served as the basis for a proposed methodology to the American Carbon Registry for carbon offset credits. "The conclusion of the ACR peer reviewers was that the methodology should not be accepted since the scientific literature does not provide sufficient evidence of the stability of soil carbon sequestration in fields treated with biochar using H:Corg ratio correlations as cited in the International Biochar Initiative's Standard Test Method for Estimating Biochar Carbon Stability (Bc+100)." (email response Nov 1, 2016 from ACR / o Winrock.org to web query on "Current status of Biochar w/rt offset credits") The Resident Matter metric is a more convenient and affordable indicator of stable carbon content in a biochar sample and is adopted in lieu of the previous C content approach.
				Source of Error - Incorrectly dried sample has excess weight due to adsorbed moisture, lowering Corg determination and elevating hydrogen measurment		
Molar H/C₀ng ratio	Required 0.7 maximum (molar ratio)	see above for H and Corg determination	Required 0.7 maximum (molar ratio)	see above for H and $C_{\rm org}$ determination	Deleted	
Molar O/C ratio	Required 0.4 maximum (molar ratio)	O calculated from ash content, C, H, N, S (DIN 51733. ISO 17247)	Not required	N/A	Deleted	
pН	Required	DIN ISO 10390 with 1:5 biochar to 0.01 M CaCl2-	Required	US Composting Council TMECC Section 04.11, modified dilution of 1:20	Required in "As Is Biochar" Procedure as "Contact pH"	Contact "As Is Biochar" with clean water, agitate for one hour, measure
		solution, 60 min shaking, measuring directly in the		biochar: deionized H2O (w:v) and equilibration 90 minutes on the shaker,		pH of clear filtrate
	Declaration If >10, the delivery slip must feature appropriate handling information	suspension	Declaration (pH)	according to Rajkovich et al (2011).	Required in "Wetted Biochar" Procedure as "Extract pH"	 Flood micropores of dried biochar with clean water by boiling twice, measure pH of clear filtrate
Electrical	Required	Method of the BGK (Federal quality community compost), volume 1, method	Required	US Composting Council TMECC Section 04.10, modified dilution of 1:20 biochar:deionized H2O (w:v) and equilibration 90 minutes on the shaker,	Required in "As Is Biochar" Procedure as "Contact TDS/EC"	Contact "As Is Biochar" with clean water, agitate for one hour, measure TDS/EC of clear filtrate, report in measured units
,	Declaration (µS cm-1)	III. C2 in analogy to DIN ISO 11265 Adding 1:10 H2O to the sample, shaking for 1h, followed by filtration of the solution.	Declaration (dS m-1)	according to Rajkovich et al (2011)	Required in "Wetted Biochar" Procedure as "Extract TDS/EC"	Flood micorpores of dried biochar with clean water by boiling twice, measure TDS/EC of clear filtrate, report in measured units
Liming equivalence	Not required		Required (if pH > 7)	AOAC 955.01 potentiometric titration on "as received" (i.e., wet) samples. Use dry weight to calculate % CaCO3 and report "per dry sample weight".	Optional (recommended) if Inorganics (Ash) level > 20 wt % or Contact or Extract pH >8	Standard soil analysis for calcium carbonate equilivalent and liming characteristics
			Declaration (% CaCO3)		Declaration (CaCO3 equivalent)	

Macro- nutrients (NPK)	Required (Total N)	Dry combustion-IR detection following the same procedure for total C and H (DIN 51732)	Required (Total N)	Dry combustion-IR detection following the same procedure for total C and H	Not required - Not Recommended - studies have shown most biochar N is part of the aromatic graphitic matrix and not bio-available	Report Total N with statement "Note: A significant portion of the measured Total N is typically not bio-available"
	Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis) Required (Total P, K, Mg, Ca) Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis)	Digestion with Lithium metaborate on ash 550 °C according to DIN 51729-11 and determination with ICP-OES according to DIN EN ISO 11885 or ICP-MS according to DIN EN ISO 17294	Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis) Optional (Total P and K) Declaration (% of total mass, dry basis)	Modified dry ashing followed by ICP (Enders and Lehmann 2012), 500 °C ashing followed by HNO3 and H2O2 digestion and determination by ICP-OES analysis	Optional (Total P and K), (recommended) if Inorganics (Ash) level > 20 wt % Provide standard soil analysis from outside lab	Standard soil analysis for fertilizer values, optional micronutrients
	N/A N/A		Optional (Mineral N (ammonium and nitrate)) Declaration (mg kg-1)	2M KCl extraction, followed by spectrophotometry (Rayment and Higginson 1992)	Optional (Mineral N (ammonium and nitrate)) Declaration (mg kg.1)	2M KCl extraction, followed by spectrophotometry (Rayment and Higginson 1992)
			Optional (Available P) Declaration (mg kg-1)	2% formic acid followed by spectrophotometry as described by Wang et al (2012)	Optional (Available P) Declaration (mg kg 1)	2% formic acid followed by spectrophotometry as described by Wang et al (2012)
Liming equivalence	Not required		Required (if pH > 7)	AOAC 955.01 potentiometric titration on "as received" (i.e., wet) samples. Use dry weight to calculate % CaCO ₃ and report "per dry sample weight".	Optional (recommended) if Inorganics (Ash) level > 20 wt % and/or Contact or Extract pH >8	Standard soil analysis for calcium carbonate equilivalent and liming characteristics
			Declaration (% CaCO ₃)		Declaration (CaCO3 equivalent)	
Bulk density	Required	Bulk density: DIN 51705	Not required	N/A	Required - density metrics provided for As Is, Dry, and Wetted Biochars	see Individual BBM Procedures for: As Is Bulk Density, Dry Bulk Density, Wetted Biochar Density
	Declaration		N/A		Declaration (weight per volume, appropriate units)	
Particle size distribution	Not required	N/A	Required	Progressive dry sieving with 50mm, 25mm, 16mm, 8mm, 4mm, 2mm, 1mm, and 0.5mm sieves.	Optional and Recommended: if greater than 10 wt % of particles over 1/4 $^{\prime\prime}$	Progressive dry sieving with 50mm, 25mm, 16mm, 8mm, 4mm, 2mm, 1mm, and 0.5mm sieves.
	N/A		Declaration		Declaration (weight % in each size class)	
Surface area	Required (Specific surface area)	milled < 50μm, 2h outgassing at 150°C, vacuum, N ₂	Optional (Total surface area and external	I ASTM D6556 'Standard Test Method for Carbon	Replaced by Adsorption Capacity Assay	see BBM Procedures Appendix A on Adsorption Capacity Options: GACS
	Declaration (preferably higher than 150 m2g-1)	adsorption, multi-point BET method	surface area) Declaration (m2g.1)	Black – Total and External Surface Area by Nitrogen Adsorption'	Declaration (wt % of challenge gas per unit weight of dry biochar)	or Propane or Butane Activity (based on ASTM D5742: Standard Test Method for Determination of the Butane Activity of Activated Carbon)
				Source of Error - BET-N2 is not recommended for micro- porous materials; surface area does not accurately predict biochar adsorption properties		
Water Holding	Optional	Water holding capacity determining by soaking and	Not required	N/A	Replaced by Water Holding Ratio	see BBM Wetted Biochar Procedures: Fully wetted bochar is drained for
Capacity		drying the sample (E DIN ISO 14238). WHC calculated as mass percentage of saturated and dry mass.	N/A		Ratio of weight of water in drained mass to weight of dried biochar	one hour, then total weight of wetted drained mass and dry mass of biochar determined
Heavy Metals, metalloids and other elements	Required Metals: Pb, Cd, Cu, Ni, Hg, Zn, Cr see original document	All metals: microwave acid digestion with HF/HNOs and determination of the metals with ICP-MS (DN EN ISO 1224-2) Hg: DIN EN 1483 Water quality - Determination of mercury - Method using atomic absorption spectrometry (H-AAS)	Required Metals: Pb, Cd, Cu, Ni, Hg, Zn, Cr, Co, Mo Metalloids: B, As, Se, Others: Cl, Na	All elements except Hg and CI: i. Microwave-assisted HNO3 digestion, or iii. HNO3 digestion, followed by determination with iii. ICP-AES, or iv. Flame AAS (according to US Composting Council TMECC Sections 04.05 and 04.06) Hg: US EPA 7471 Mercury in Solid or Semi-Solid Waste (Manual Cold Vapor Technique) CI: water soluble elements followed by ion chromatography or ion-selective electrode (per manufacturers instructions)	Optional: if any specific reason to expect heavy metal contaminition; Recommend: if required by regulatory authority for specific biochar appication	Recommend: appropriate analytical procedure for specific heavy metals of concern at detection level below regulatory threshold
PAHs	Required - see original document	Soxhlet-extraction with toluene with GC/MS or HPLC	Required - see original document	Soxhlet-extraction with toluene then US EPA 8270 SVOCs by GC/MS	Optional: for PAHs, PCBs and PCDD/Fs if any specific reason to expect individual contaminates should be present; Recommended: if required by regulatory subtority for specific his/char application	Recommend analytical procedure for bio-available/leachable assay, Recommend against Soxhlet-extraction with toluene with GC/MS or HPLC
PCBs	Required - see original document	Soxhlet-extraction with toluene with HRGC-HRMS	Required - see original document	US EPA 8082 - PCBs by GC or EPA 8275 - PAHs &	autionty for specific blochar application	
PCDD/Fs	Required - see original document	Soxhlet-extraction with toluene with HRGC-HRMS	Required - see original document	US EPA 8290 - HRGC/HRMS		
Germination inhibition	Not required N/A	N/A	Required Pass/Fail	OECD methodology (1984) using three test species, as described by Van Zwieten et al (2010)	Deleted	Inadequate scientific literature to support analytical method and provide conclusive insights into biochar properties; method excessively dependent on choice of seeds and remaining soil matrix; analysis results excessively application-specific